### Rota's Classification Problem for Nonsymmetric Operads

#### Li GUO Rutgers University at Newark

#### (joint work with Xing Gao and Huhu Zhang)

# Motivation: Classification of Linear Operators

- Throughout the history, mathematical objects are often understood through studying operators defined on them.
- Well-known examples include Galois theory where fields are studied by their automorphisms (the Galois group),
- and analysis and geometry where functions and manifolds are studied through their derivations, integrals and related vector fields,
- and differential Galois theory where both operators occur.

## Rota's Problem

By the 1970s, several other operators had been discovered from studies in analysis, probability and combinatorics.

Average operator P(x)P(y) = P(xP(y)), Inverse average operator P(x)P(y) = P(P(x)y), (Rota-)Baxter operator  $P(x)P(y) = P(xP(y)) + P(P(x)y) + \lambda P(xy)$ , where  $\lambda$  is a fixed constant,

Reynolds operator P(x)P(y) = P(xP(y)) + P(P(x)y) - P(P(x)P(y)).

Rota posed the problem of finding all the identities that could be satisfied by a linear operator defined on associative algebras. He also suggested that there should not be many such operators other than these previously known ones.

## Quotation from Rota and Known Operators

- "In a series of papers, I have tried to show that other linear operators satisfying algebraic identities may be of equal importance in studying certain algebraic phenomena, and I have posed the problem of finding all possible algebraic identities that can be satisfied by a linear operator on an algebra. Simple computations show that the possibility are very few, and the problem of classifying all such identities is very probably completely solvable."
- Little progress was made on finding all such operators while new operators have merged from physics and combinatorial studies, such as

Nijenhuis operator Leroux's TD operator

$$P(x)P(y) = P(xP(y) + P(x)y - P(xy)), P(x)P(y) = P(xP(y) + P(x)y - xP(1)y).$$

## Other Post-Rota developments

- These previously known operators continued to find remarkable applications in pure and applied mathematics.
- Vast theories were established for differential algebra and difference algebra, with wide applications, including Wen-Tsun Wu's mechanical proof of geometric theorems and mathematics mechanization (based on work of Ritt).
- Rota-Baxter algebra has found applications in classical Yang-Baxter equations, operads, combinatorics, and most prominently, the renormalization of quantum field theory through the Hopf algebra framework of Connes and Kreimer.
- How to understand Rota's problem?

# PI Algebras

- What is an algebraic identity that is satisfied by a linear operator?—Polynomial identity (PI) algebras gives a simplified analogue:
- ► A **k**-algebra *R* is called a PI algebra (Procesi, Rowen, ...) if there is a fixed element  $f(x_1, \dots, x_n)$  in the noncommutative polynomial algebra (that is, the free algebra)  $\mathbf{k}\langle x_1, \dots, x_n \rangle$  such that

$$f(a_1, \cdots, a_n) = 0, \quad \forall a_1, \cdots, a_n \in R.$$

Thus an algebraic identity satisfied by an algebra is an element in the free algebra.

Then an algebraic identity satisfied by a linear operator should be an element in a free algebra with an operator, a so called free operated algebra.

## Operated algebras

- An operated **k**-algebra is a **k**-algebra *R* with a linear operator  $\alpha$  on *R*.
- **Examples.** Differential algebras and Rota-Baxter algebras.
- We can also consider algebras with multiple operators, such as differential-difference algebras, differential Rota-Baxter algebras, Rota-Baxter families and matching Rota-Baxter algebras.
- ▶ An operated ideal of *R* is an ideal *I* of *R* such that  $\alpha(I) \subseteq I$ .
- A homomorphism from an operated k-algebra (R, α) to an operated k-algebra (S, β) is a k-linear map f : R → S such that f ∘ α = β ∘ f.
- The adjoint functor of the forgetful functor from the category of operated algebras to the category of sets gives the free operated k-algebras.
- More precisely, a free operated k-algebra on a set X is an operated k-algebra ( $\mathbf{k} ||X||, \alpha_X$ ) together with a map  $j_X : X \to \mathbf{k} ||X||$  with the property that, for any operated algebra  $(R, \beta)$  together with a map  $f : X \to R$ , there is a unique morphism  $\overline{f} : (\mathbf{k} ||X||, \alpha_X) \to (R, \beta)$  of operated algebras such that  $f = \overline{f} \circ j_X$ .

## Bracketed words

- For any set Y, let [Y] := { [y ] | y ∈ Y } denote a set indexed by Y and disjoint from Y.
- ► For a fixed set X, let  $\mathfrak{M}_0 = \mathfrak{M}(X)_0 = M(X)$  (free monoid). For  $n \ge 0$ , let  $\mathfrak{M}_{n+1} := M(X \cup [\mathfrak{M}_n])$ .
- With the embedding X ∪ [𝔅n<sub>n-1</sub>] → X ∪ [𝔅n<sub>n</sub>], we obtain an embedding of monoids i<sub>n</sub> : 𝔅n<sub>n</sub> → 𝔅n<sub>n+1</sub>, giving the direct limit 𝔅(X) := lim 𝔅n<sub>n</sub>.
- Elements of  $\mathfrak{M}(X)$  are called bracketed words.
- M(X) can also be identified with elements of M(X ∪ {[,]}) such that [ and ] are paired with each other.
- $\mathfrak{M}(X)$  can also be constructed by rooted trees and Motzkin paths.

Theorem. 1. The set 𝔅(X), equipped with the concatenation product, the operator w ↦ [w], w ∈ 𝔅(X), and the natural embedding j<sub>X</sub> : X → 𝔅(X), is the free operated monoid on X.
 2. k ||X|| := k𝔅(X) (k-span) is the free operated unitary k-algebra on X.

# **Operated Polynomial Identities**

► An operated k-algebra (R, P) is called an operated PI (OPI) k-algebra if there is a fixed element  $\phi(x_1, \dots, x_n) \in \mathbf{k} || x_1, \dots, x_n ||$ such that the evaluation map

$$\phi(a_1, \cdots, a_n) = 0, \quad \forall a_1, \cdots, a_n \in \mathbf{R}.$$

where a pair of brackets  $\lfloor \rfloor$  is replaced by *P* everywhere.

- More precisely, for any  $f : \{x_1, \dots, x_n\} \to R$ , the unique  $\overline{f} : \mathbf{k} || x_1, \dots, x_n || \to R$  of operated algebras sends  $\phi$  to zero.
- ▶ Then (R, P) is called a  $\phi$ -k-algebra and P a  $\phi$ -operator.

#### Examples

1. When  $\phi = [xy] - x[y] - [x]y$ , a  $\phi$ -operator (resp. algebra) is a differential operator (resp. algebra).

2. When  $\phi = [x][y] - [x[y]] - [[x]y] - \lambda[xy]$ , a  $\phi$ -operator (resp.  $\phi$ -algebra) is a Rota-Baxter operator (resp. algebra) of weight  $\lambda$ . 3. When  $\phi = [x] - x$ , then a  $\phi$ -algebra is just an associative algebra. Together with identities from the noncommutative polynomial algebra  $\mathbf{k}\langle X \rangle$ , we get a PI-algebra.

## Free $\phi$ -algebras

Proposition Let φ = φ(x<sub>1</sub>, · · · , x<sub>k</sub>) ∈ k ||X|| be given. For any set Z, the free φ-algebra on Z is given by the quotient operated algebra k ||Z|| / I<sub>φ,Z</sub> where I<sub>φ,Z</sub> is the operated ideal of k ||Z|| generated by the set

$$\{\phi(u_1,\cdots,u_k)\mid u_1,\cdots,u_k\in\mathbf{k}\|Z\|\}.$$

#### Examples

- When  $\phi = [x] x$ , then the quotient  $\mathbf{k} ||Z|| / I_{\phi,Z}$  gives the free algebra  $\mathbf{k} \langle Z \rangle$  on *Z*.
- When φ = [xy] − x[y] − [x]y, then the quotient gives the free noncommutative differential polynomial algebra k{Z} := k⟨∆(Z)⟩ on Z, where Δ(X) := Z<sub>≥0</sub> × Z is the set of "differential variables".

A major problem is to determine a canonical basis of  $\mathbf{k} ||Z|| / I_{\phi,Z}$ .

# Remarks:

- ► A classification of linear operators can be regarded as a classification of elements in k || X ||.
- This problem is precise, but is too broad.
- We remind ourselves that Rota also wanted the operators to be defined on associative algebras.
- ► This means that the operated identity *φ* ∈ k ||*x*<sub>1</sub>, · · · , *x<sub>n</sub>*|| should be compatible with the associativity condition.
- What does this mean?

## Examples of compatibility with associativity

• Example 1: For 
$$\phi(x, y) = [xy] - [x]y - x[y]$$
, we have  
 $[xy] \mapsto [x]y + x[y].$ 

Thus

$$[(xy)z] \mapsto [xy]z + (xy)[z] \mapsto [x]yz + x[y]z + xy[z].$$
$$[x(yz)] \mapsto [x](yz) + x[yz] \mapsto [x]yz + x[y]z + xy[z].$$

So [(xy)z] and [x(yz)] have the same reduction, indicating that the differential operator is consistent with the associativity condition.

#### More examples

• Example 2: The same is true for the right multiplier:  $\phi(x, y) = [xy] - [x]y$ :

$$\lfloor x \rfloor yz \leftrightarrow \lfloor xy \rfloor z \leftrightarrow [(xy)z] = \lfloor x(yz) \rfloor \mapsto [x]yz.$$

▶ Example 3: Suppose  $\phi(x, y) = [xy] - [y]x$ . Then  $[xy] \mapsto [y]x$ . So

$$[w]uv \leftarrow [(uv)w] = [u(vw)] \mapsto [vw]u \mapsto [w]vu.$$

Thus a  $\phi$ -algebra ( $R, \delta$ ) needs to satisfy the weak commutativity:

$$\delta(w)(uv - vu) = 0, \forall u, v, w \in Z.$$

So this operator might not be what Rota had in mind!

## Differential type operators

► differential operator [xy] = [x]y + x[y], differential operator of weight \(\lambda\) [xy] = [x]y + x[y] + \(\lambda\)[x][y], homomorphism [xy] = [x][y], semihomomorphism [xy] = x[y].

• They are of the form [xy] = N(x, y) where

- 1.  $N(x, y) \in \mathbf{k} ||x, y||$  is in DRF, namely, it does not contain  $[uv], u, v \neq 1$ , that is, N(x, y) is in  $\mathbf{k}\mathfrak{D}(x, y)$ ;
- 2. N(uv, w) = N(u, vw) is reduced to zero under the reduction  $[xy] \mapsto N(x, y)$ .

An operator identity  $\phi(x, y) = 0$  is said of differential type if  $\phi(x, y) = [xy] - N(x, y)$  where N(x, y) satisfies these properties. We call N(x, y) and an operator satisfying  $\phi(x, y) = 0$  of differential type.

## Classification of differential type operators

- ► (Rota's Problem: the Differential Case) Find all operated polynomial identities of differential type by finding all expressions N(x, y) ∈ k ||x, y|| of differential type.
- Conjecture (OPIs of Differential Type) Let k be a field of characteristic zero. Every expression N(x, y) ∈ k ||x, y|| of differential type takes one of the forms below for some a, b, c, e ∈ k :

1. 
$$b(x\lfloor y \rfloor + \lfloor x \rfloor y) + c\lfloor x \rfloor \lfloor y \rfloor + exy$$
 where  $b^2 = b + ce$ ,

2. 
$$ce^2yx + exy + c\lfloor y \rfloor \lfloor x \rfloor - ce(y\lfloor x \rfloor + \lfloor y \rfloor x),$$

3. 
$$axy[1] + b[1]xy + cxy$$
,

4. 
$$x\lfloor y \rfloor + \lfloor x \rfloor y + ax \lfloor 1 \rfloor y + bxy$$
,

5. 
$$\lfloor x \rfloor y + a(x \lfloor 1 \rfloor y - xy \lfloor 1 \rfloor),$$

6. 
$$x \lfloor y \rfloor + a(x \lfloor 1 \rfloor y - \lfloor 1 \rfloor xy)$$

# **Rewriting systems**

•  $\phi(x, y) := \lfloor xy \rfloor - N(x, y) \in \mathbf{k} \Vert x, y \Vert$  defines a rewriting system:

$$\Sigma_{\phi} := \left\{ \lfloor ab \rfloor \mapsto \mathcal{N}(a, b) \mid a, b \in \mathfrak{M}(Z) \setminus \{1\} \right\}, \tag{1}$$

where Z is a set.

- More precisely, for g, g' ∈ k ||Z||, denote g →<sub>Σ<sub>φ</sub></sub> g' if g' is obtained from g by replacing a subword ⌊ab⌋ in a monomial of g by N(a, b).
- A rewriting system Σ is call
  - terminating if every reduction  $g_0 \mapsto_{\Sigma} g_1 \mapsto \cdots$  stops after finite steps,
  - confluent if any two reductions of g can be reduced to the same element.
  - convergent if it is both terminating and confluent.
- Theorem φ = [xy] N(x, y) defines a differential type operator if and only if the rewriting system Σ<sub>φ</sub> is convergent.

# Monomial well orderings

- Let Z be a set. Let M<sup>\*</sup>(Z) denote the bracketed words in Z ∪ {\*} where \* appears exactly once.
- For  $q \in \mathfrak{M}^{\star}(Z)$  and  $u \in \mathfrak{M}(Z)$ , let  $q|_u$  denote the bracketed word in  $\mathfrak{M}(Z)$  when  $\star$  in q is replaced by u.
- Then g →<sub>Σ<sub>φ</sub></sub> g' if there are q ∈ M<sup>\*</sup>(Z) and a, b ∈ M(Z) such that
   1. q|<sub>[ab]</sub> is a monomial of g with coefficient c ≠ 0,
   2. g' = g cq|<sub>[ab]-N(a,b)</sub>.
- ► A monomial ordering on M(Z) is a well-ordering < on M(X) such that</p>

 $1 \leq u$  and  $u < v \Rightarrow q|_u < q|_v, \ \forall u, v \in \mathfrak{M}(X), q \in \mathfrak{M}^*(X).$ 

- ► Given a monomial ordering < and a bracketed polynomial s ∈ k ||X||, we let s̄ denote the leading bracketed word (monomial) of s.</p>
- If the coefficient of s̄ in s is 1, we call s monic with respect to the monomial order <.</p>

#### Gröbner-Shirshov bases

- Bokut, Chen and Qiu (JPAA, 2010) determined Gröbner-Shirshov bases for free nonunitary operated algebras. This can be similarly given for free unitary operated algebras k ||Z||.
- ► Let > be a monomial ordering on 𝔐(Z). Let f, g be two monic bracketed polynomials.
- ▶ For  $p, q \in \mathfrak{M}^{\star}(Z)$  and  $s, t \in \mathbf{k} ||Z||$ , if  $w := p|_{\overline{s}} = q|_{\overline{t}}$ , then call

$$(f,g)^{p,q}_w := p|_s - q|_t$$

a composition of *f* and *g*.

- ▶ For  $S \subseteq \mathbf{k} ||Z||$  and  $u \in \mathbf{k} ||Z||$ , we call *u* trivial modulo (S, w) if  $u = \sum_i c_i q_i|_{s_i}$ , with  $c_i \in \mathbf{k}$ ,  $q_i \in \mathfrak{M}^{\star}(Z)$ ,  $s_i \in S$  and  $q_i|_{\overline{s_i}} < w$ .
- ► A set  $S \subseteq \mathbf{k} ||X||$  is called a Gröbner-Shirshov basis if, for all  $f, g \in S$ , all compositions  $(f, g)_w^{p,q}$  of f and g are trivial modulo (S, w).

Differential type, rewriting systems and Gröbner-Shirshov bases

► Theorem. (Guo-Sit-R. Zhang, 2013) For

 $\phi(x, y) := \lfloor xy \rfloor - N(x, y) \in \mathbf{k} ||x, y||$ , the following statements are equivalent.

- $\phi(x, y)$  is of differential type;
- ► The rewriting system  $\Sigma_{\phi} = \{ \lfloor ab \rfloor \mapsto N(a, b) \}$  is convergent;
- Let Z be a set with a well ordering. With a predefined monomial order >, the set

$$\mathcal{S} := \mathcal{S}_{\phi} := \{ \phi(u, v) = \delta(uv) - \mathcal{N}(u, v) | \ u, v \in \mathfrak{M}(Z) \setminus \{1\} \}$$

is a Gröbner-Shirshov basis in  $\mathbf{k} ||Z||$ ;

► The free  $\phi$ -algebra on a set Z is the noncommutative polynomial **k**-algebra  $\mathbf{k}\langle\Delta(Z)\rangle$ , together with the operator  $d := d_Z$  on  $\mathbf{k}\langle\Delta(Z)\rangle$  defined by the following recursion:

Let  $u = u_1 u_2 \cdots u_k \in M(\Delta(Z))$ , where  $u_i \in \Delta(Z), 1 \le i \le k$ .

- 1. If k = 1, i.e.,  $u = \delta^{i}(x)$  for some  $i \ge 0, x \in Z$ , then define  $d(u) = \delta^{(i+1)}(x)$ .
- 2. If  $k \ge 1$ , then define  $d(u) = N(u_1, u_2 \cdots u_k)$ .

#### Rota-Baxter type operators

What Rota-Baxter operator, average operator, Nijenhuis operator, etc. have in common is that they are of the form

[u][v] = [M(u, v)]

where M(u, v) is in  $\mathbf{k}\mathfrak{M}'(Z)$ .

• The expression M(u, v) is formally associative:

M(M(u, v), w) = M(u, M(v, w))

modulo the relation  $\phi_M := [u][v] - [M(u, v)].$ 

- ▶ The rewriting rule  $\lfloor u \rfloor \lfloor v \rfloor \mapsto \lfloor M(u, v) \rfloor$  is convergent.
- ► A  $\phi(x, y) := \lfloor x \rfloor \lfloor y \rfloor \lfloor M(x, y) \rfloor$  of the above form is called a Rota-Baxter type operator.

## Conjecture on Rota-Baxter type operators

• Conjecture. Any Rota-Baxter type operator is of the form P(x)P(y) = P(M(x, y)),

for an M(x, y) from the following list (new types in red).

- 1. xP(y) (average operator)
- 2. P(x)y (reverse average operator)
- 3. xP(y) + yP(x)
- 4. P(x)y + P(y)x
- 5. xP(y) + P(x)y P(xy) (Nijenhuis operator)
- 6.  $xP(y) + P(x)y + e_1xy$  (RBA with weight  $e_1$ )
- 7.  $xP(y) xP(1)y + e_1xy$

8. 
$$P(x)y - xP(1)y + e_1xy$$

- 9.  $xP(y) + P(x)y xP(1)y + e_1xy$  (TD operator with weight  $e_1$ )
- 10.  $xP(y) + P(x)y xyP(1) xP(1)y + e_1xy$
- 11.  $xP(y) + P(x)y P(xy) xP(1)y + e_1xy$
- 12.  $xP(y) + P(x)y xP(1)y P(1)xy + e_1xy$
- 13.  $d_0 x P(1)y + e_1 xy$  (generalized endomorphisms)
- 14.  $d_2 y P(1) x + e_0 y x$

# Classification of Rota-Baxter type operators

- ► Theorem (Gao-Guo-Sit-S. Zheng) For  $\phi(x, y) := \lfloor x \rfloor \lfloor y \rfloor \lfloor M(x, y) \rfloor$ , the following statements are equivalent.
- $\phi(x, y)$  is of Rota-Baxter type;
- The rewriting system from  $\phi(x, y)$  is convergent;
- There is a Gröbner-Shirshove basis for the ideal of  $\phi(x, y)$ ;
- Free algebras in the corresponding category have canonical bases given by the *Rota-Baxter words*.
- Corollary All operators in the above list are Rota-Baxter type operators.

# General formulations for associative algebras

- (Rota's Classification Problem via rewriting systems) Determine all convergent systems of OPIs.
- Example. (Two-sided) averaging operator *P* is defined to satisfy

$$P(x_1)P(x_2) = P(P(x_1)x_2) = P(x_1P(x_2))$$

It is not convergent.

- (Rota's Classification Problem via Gröbner-Shirshov bases) Determine all Gröbner-Shirshov systems of OPIs.
- A Gröbner-Shirshov system of OPIs is convergent.

# Baby model: multiplicative superalgebra

- ▶ Consider an algebra  $H = H_1 \oplus H_0$  with subalgebras  $H_1, H_0$  such that  $H_iH_j \subseteq H_{ij}, i, j \in \{0, 1\}$ . So  $H_1$  is a subalgebra and  $H_0$  is an ideal. Such an algebra is called a multiplicative superalgebra.
- Let (A, ·) be an algebra. Let (R, \*) be an algebra with multiplication \*. Let ℓ, r : A → End<sub>k</sub>(R) be two linear maps.
- We call (R, \*, ℓ, r) or simply R an A-bimodule k-algebra if (R, ℓ, r) is an A-bimodule that is compatible with the multiplication \* on R:

$$\ell(x)(v * w) = (\ell(x)v) * w, (v * w)r(x) = v * (wr(x)), (vr(x)) * w = v * (\ell(x)w), \text{ for all } x, y \in A, v, w \in R.$$

- Every multiplicative superalgebras is of the form  $A \oplus R = A(\mathbf{k}1 \oplus R)$ where *A* is an algebra and *R* is an *A*-bimodule algebra.
- Free multiplicative superalgebra with given  $H_0$  is a quotient of  $H_0 \oplus B(M)$ , where B(M) is the free *A*-bimodule algebra spanned by a module *M*.

## Disconnected operads as "superoperads"

- Most studied on operad are focused on the connected ones, that is S-modules P := (P<sub>n</sub>)<sub>n≥0</sub> with P<sub>1</sub> = kid (and reduced: P<sub>0</sub> = 0);
- A (reduced) disconnected operad 𝒫 has a "super" decomposition 𝒫 = 𝒫<sub>=1</sub> ⊕ 𝒫<sub>>1</sub> = 𝒫<sub>=1</sub> ◦ 𝒫<sub>>1</sub>, where 𝒫<sub>=1</sub> is the operad with 𝒫<sub>1</sub> concentrated at arity 1 and 𝒫<sub>>1</sub> is the connected operad (kid, 𝒫<sub>2</sub>, 𝒫<sub>3</sub>, ···).
- ► This is similar to a multiplicative superalgebra in the sense that P<sub>>1</sub> is closed under compositions with P<sub>1</sub>.
- We can regard 𝒫 as the connected operad 𝒫<sub>≥2</sub> with linear operations from 𝒫<sub>1</sub>, and pose an analogous Rota's Classification Problem for operads.

# Operad forms of the classification problem

- (Weak form) For a connected operad P = T(M)/(S) with generator space spanned by *M* and relation space spanned by a Gröbner-Shirshov basis *S*. Determine operators P<sub>=1</sub> = T(P)/(S<sub>P</sub>) on P such that S ∪ S<sub>P</sub> is a Gröbner-Shirshov basis (for T(M ⊕ P)).
- In (Strong form) Determine operators P<sub>=1</sub> = 𝔅(P)/(S<sub>P</sub>) such that the weak form holds for every connected operad 𝔅 = 𝔅(M)/(S) with generator space spanned by M and relation space spanned by a Gröbner-Shirshov basis S.

# Special cases

Let 𝒫 = 𝔅(𝑘)/(𝔅) be a binary quadratic nonsymmetric operad. Define the differential 𝒫 operad to be

$$\mathcal{DP} := \mathcal{T}(M_d)/(S \sqcup S_d),$$

where  $M_d := (M_0, M_1 \oplus \mathbf{k}\{d\}, M_2, \cdots, M_n, \cdots)$  and  $S_d$  is a set of Leibniz rules on  $\mathcal{P}$ .

- ▶ If *S* is a Gröbner-Shirshov basis in  $\mathcal{T}(M)$ , then  $S \sqcup S_d$  is a Gröbner-Shirshov basis in  $\mathcal{T}(M_d)$  for the operad  $\mathcal{DP}$ .
- A similar statement holds for Rota-Baxter operators.

# Summary and outlook

- A long standing problem of Rota is the classification of linear operators on algebras that satisfy algebraic identities.
- This problem is made precise in the context of operated polynomial algebras and rewriting systems;
- This problem is treated in two cases: differential type and Rota-Baxter type operators, with the help of rewriting systems and Gröber-Shirshov bases;
- Similar methods can be applied to treat other classes of operators on associative algebras, and further to operads;
- Roughly speaking, the linear operators that interested Rota and maybe other mathematicians (good operators) should be the ones whose defining identities define convergent rewriting systems (good systems), or possesses Gröbner-Shirshov bases (good bases).
- Similar questions can be asked for linear operators on operads.

# Thank You!